

OI-JB-P2-003: A File Is Not a Bone

Canonical Precedent #003 - Empty Bone / Fake Bone - Prompt-to-Authority Issue Card - Public Edition v1.1

Structure is not substance. A valid record must carry semantic load.

Case Snapshot

CASE ID	OI-JB-P2-003
CARD TYPE	Prompt-to-Authority Issue Card
PUBLIC STATUS	Canonical public precedent - Public Edition v1.1
FAILURE CLASS	Empty Bone / Fake Bone
DECISION	FAIL

Public Summary

This case shows why AI workflows cannot trust documents merely because they exist. A file can be present. Headings can be present. The proof can still be absent.

Orange checks whether a record carries semantic load, evidence, judgment, and audit value before treating it as a valid record.

Core Judgment

FAIL: Empty Bone / Fake Bone.

A record is invalid when it only materializes file shape, headings, placeholders, or generic claims without semantic load-bearing content.

The failure is not merely missing content. The failure is mistaking structure for substance.

What Happened

The system recognized that a document or record needed to exist. But the authority requirement was not file creation alone. The real requirement was a semantically valid, evidence-bearing, auditable record.

When file existence, headings, template shape, or polished prose stand in for meaning, the workflow risks accepting a hollow record as proof.

Public Orange Judgment

ALLOWED	Accept concise records when they carry enough semantic load to support their claims. Use structure as a container, not as proof.
FORBIDDEN	Treat file presence, headings, template shape, placeholders, polished prose, or generic claims as evidence of valid semantic completion.
REQUIRED	Check semantic load, evidence value, judgment value, audit value, and claim boundary before treating a record as valid.

Public Intervention Boundary

Orange distinguishes document shape from document authority. A record must not become evidence merely because it looks complete.

Artifact Exists -> Semantic Load Check -> Evidence Boundary -> Public Issue Card or Release Log

Public Intervention Steps

1	Inspect whether the artifact carries semantic load, not merely file shape.
2	Identify placeholder-style, generic, or unsupported completion language.
3	Separate formatting quality from evidence quality.
4	Reject Empty Bone when content is absent or non-auditable.
5	Reject Fake Bone when absence is presented as proof.
6	Route the case to repair, blocker classification, or a valid public release boundary.

Reusable Rule

Structure Without Semantic Load = Empty Bone

Absence Presented As Proof = Fake Bone

Canonical form: a record without semantic load-bearing content is not a record.

Precedent Value

This card establishes the third Prompt-to-Authority principle: structure is not substance. Document shape is not semantic authority.

Public Boundary Notice

This public card discloses the judgment principle, failure class, and public intervention boundary only.

It does not disclose internal rule-compilation logic, executable gate implementation, evidence schema, negative-control library, automation workflow, customer-specific judgment memory, or private engineering records. The complete internal record is maintained separately by Nimclea Systems LLC.